Introduction

This report has been drafted by the EQAVET National Reference Point of Turkey and describes the main quality assurance arrangements in vocational education and training.

SECTION A - DESCRIPTION OF QUALITY ASSURANCE ARRANGEMENTS

1. Initial VET (IVET)

Introduction

In Turkey, formal ISCED 3 VET is delivered through 4-year programmes in 62 fields and 226 branches in VET secondary schools and institutions. VECs provide apprenticeship programmes in 31 fields / 152 branches. A range of private institutions also provides non-formal social, cultural and vocational education to fee-paying adults. In 2013 - 2014 ISCED 3 VET catered for 2,307,713, 55% male and 45% female. The share of VET enrolment in Upper Secondary Education was 45.4% (2013), representing an increasing trend.
Participation in 'lifelong learning' was 4% in 2013, with considerable divergence between the regions (5.6% - 1.3%). In 2013, over 220,075 registered unemployed persons participated in training.

The Tenth Development Plan (2014-18) includes plans for VET development in the Basic and Vocational Skills Development Programme. The vision for the VET system mainly lies in the Vocational and Technical Education Strategy Document and Action Plan 2014 - 2018 prepared by MoNE in cooperation with other ministries and the social partners and which will be implemented, monitored and evaluated in collaboration with relevant parties under the coordination of MoNE. The VET Strategy is complemented by the Lifelong Learning Strategy 2014 -2018 (which commits to increasing participation in lifelong learning to 8% by 2018 and 15% by 2023 and provides for an integrated monitoring and evaluation system on key performance indicators) and by the National Employment Strategy (NES) http://www.uis.gov.tr/uis/EylemPlanlariEN), which plans workforce training for 400,000 people annually.

1.1 Quality assurance arrangements at system level in IVET

- National Framework for quality assurance in initial VET – who is in charge of what?

  MoNE is responsible for the non-formal, formal basic and secondary education (general and IVET) qualifications, CoHE's focus is on higher education qualifications, whereas VQA coordinates the qualifications specified by law numbered 5544. The Turkish Qualifications System, which is the responsibility of VQA and is coordinated by it, defines the preparation of national occupational standards in VET, the development of national qualifications based on national and international standards and the accreditation and monitoring of the process of validation. VQA coordinates and issues qualification certificates. VQA also has a quality assured audit process of ACBs (authorised certification bodies).
  - The Basic Law of National Education No. 1739 (1973);
  - The Vocational Education and Training Act No. 3308 (enforced 1986) and Law No. 4702 (2001);
  - The Higher Education Act No. 2547 (1981);
  - The 2006 Vocational Qualifications Authority Act No. 5544; and relevant regulatory actions make up the legal framework of VET.
  - The Law on the Organisation and Duties of Ministry of National Education (2011) decrees that formal VET is administered by the General Directorate of Vocational and Technical Education, and non-formal VET by the General Directorate of Lifelong Learning within MoNE.

  There is a range of legal acts discussing Total Quality Management (TQM):
  - Directive for Implementation of TQM, Communiques Journal no. 2506 (November 1999).
  - Directive for Awarding on Implementation of TQM of the Ministry, Communiqués Journal no. 2568 (January 2005).
  - Amendments to the Directive for Awarding on Implementation of TQM of the Ministry, Communiqués Journal no. 2590 (November 2006) and no. 2619 (April 2009).

- Statutory stakeholder involvement in quality assurance in initial VET systems

  VET has a centralised multi-level governance structure. Policy is steered by MoNE's Directorate General for VET for IVET and by CoHE at tertiary level. Provincial and District National Education Directorates across 81 provinces support the implementation of policy. Numerous other bodies help shape policy. In particular, the Board of Vocational Education (MEK) takes decisions on the planning, development and evaluation of VET in all types of formal, non-formal, and apprenticeship education, vocational and technical education schools and institutions, and enterprises where VET programmes are implemented. The Vocational Education Council (VEC) also engages in planning and development; and the Vocational Qualifications Authority (VQA) aligns VET professional qualifications with professional standards. The highly centralised, bureaucratic structure limits the capacity of schools to address immediate challenges.

  Quality assurance is defined in general terms as 'systematic monitoring and evaluating different aspects of a project, service or institution in order to determine that quality standards are met'. The extent to which the understanding of quality assurance is shared among stakeholders requires further investigation. MoNE, the Turkish Quality Association (KALDER), the Board of Inspection, the Internal Audit Unit and provincial organisations have a mandate in relation to quality

assurance in IVET. VQA has that mandate for CVET and adult education. The IPA IQVET-1 (2012) and IQVET-2 projects support the development/evaluation of a National Quality Assurance Centre for VET (VET-NQAC), which will steer the various groups involved in the NQAC (MoNE, related institutions, NGOs, training providers and social partners) and the development of a quality assurance framework using the EQARF as a reference standard.

The approach to 'lifelong learning' is based on strong partnership with all stakeholders, especially the private sector. Opportunities for continuous education and training for all (workers, jobseekers, disadvantaged persons) are jointly designed and implemented with stakeholders. Formal and non-formal learning (ISCED 3 provision) for adults takes place in a wide range of institutions, including Public Education Centres (PECs), Vocational Education Centres (VECs), Maturation Institutes, Tourism Education Centres (TECs), Open Education Institutions and Vocational and Technical Education Centres (METEM). Courses of varying duration / content and mainly funded by the state offer a combination of face-to-face and distance learning to individuals of varying ages and education levels nationwide and, in the case of Open Secondary Education, to individuals living abroad. A certificate is awarded on successful completion of a course. VET schools also provide VET courses funded by the Turkey Employment Agency (ISKUR) as part of ALMPs and the private sector is also involved under protocols signed with MoNE. Participation in activation measures is low and ALMPs still lack a coherent framework and are not systematically monitored. Foundations to integrate non-formal and formal VET are being established.

- Requirements for evaluation and review
  At secondary school level, quality assurance is the responsibility of the Ministry. MoNE runs a two-level quality assurance system where evaluation and supervision is conducted at central level by the Directorate of Guidance and Inspection and at local level by Provincial Educational Supervisors (mandate includes: guidance, evaluation, supervision, investigation, analysis, training etc.).

  School evaluations focus on compliance with central regulations and are a combination of external evaluation by ministerial school inspectors every 3 years and internal evaluation. Inspectors' reports are monitored and evaluated by the Directorate of Guidance and Inspection. VQA defines standards and appropriate procedures for quality assurance in CVET and authorises certification of organisations accredited in multilateral recognition with TURKAK
  (Turkish Accreditation Authority). CoHE is responsible for quality assurance in HE. Monitoring of HEIs is carried out by the Higher Education Supervision Board, which is part of the Higher Education Council and in charge of the external evaluation of universities, affiliated units, academic staff and their activities. In 2005, the Regulation for Academic Assessment and Quality Improvement in HEIs was adopted.

  The TQM approach has been used for quality assurance QI in VET schools since 2009. Many schools carry out self-assessment following the Excellence Model developed by the European Foundation for Quality Management (EFQM) applied as the basis of the continuous improvement of areas of concern. Self-assessment is not mandatory but TQM Provincial Facilitators offer consultancy to schools / institutions planning a self-assessment process. To motivate schools to become involved in quality improvement (QI), MoNE introduced a range of awards for quality in education for formal and non-formal VET providers, according to a range

of criteria focusing on management, performance and satisfaction ratings of stakeholders. MONE also promotes use of the ISO 9001 certificate.

Further investigation is required in relation to social partners' engagement in the governance arrangements for quality assurance related to VET provider institutions and VET provider self-evaluation standards, mechanisms, processes and procedures.

- Identification of training needs
Contemporary practices indicate that success is more likely if solutions for employment and education are developed locally, taking into account the provincial conditions in the framework of national policies. The Provincial Employment and Vocational Education Boards are important mechanisms having the potential to produce "local solutions for local problems" by means of the social dialogue method.

Provincial employment and vocational education boards have been created to mobilise local facilities and resources to lessen unemployment by providing collaboration and peer contact between different institutions and organizations. Boards consist of the representatives of other public authorities, as well as workers, employers and trade organisations, industry chambers and other local organization representatives. The expected priority tasks are:

- to determine and monitor the needs of the local labour market, needs and problems by the persons concerned,
- to provide vocational courses in the areas of labour force demand and to prevent job losses.

Board decisions are final. The Committee prepares action plans based on the decisions taken, determines the responsible institutions, practices and results. The Board meets quarterly. Secretariat is carried out jointly by the Provincial Employment Agency and the Provincial Educational Directorate within the own remits. Follow-up on the decisions taken and the other research towards labour market and different activities are performed by the Executive Board.

- Who can deliver VET and under what conditions – accreditation or other requirements on VET providers
While diplomas and workplace opening certificates are given to students who have completed vocational and technical education in formal education institutions, a certificate approved by the Ministry of National Education is given to those who have completed vocational education within the scope of non-formal education. Those who follow the mastership training in vocational education centres can open workplaces with their mastership certificates [Master Craftsperson]. Moreover, the training of individuals who attend vocational courses is evaluated for mastership certificates in line with the Regulation on Secondary Education Institutions. According to Law No 5174 and Law No 5362, chambers can devise courses in the professional branches that have not been included in Vocational Education Law No 3308, and issue certificates related to the implementation of the courses. In addition, within the scope of Article 7 of Metropolitan Municipality Law No 5216, the metropolitan municipalities have a duty and the authority to devise and operate courses to enable students to access professions and acquire skills. They are also required to cooperate with universities, colleges, vocational high schools, government agencies and NGOs when providing these services. According to Prime Minister's Notice No 2007/17,

cooperation with the Ministry of National Education is obligatory for these courses. Under Vocational Qualifications Authority Act No 5544, certification of national qualifications is legally given to the VQA. Candidates are entitled to the certificates issued by the VQA once they have been subjected to assessment by the authorised institutions. In this context, the VQA initiated the Strengthening the Vocational

Qualifications Authority Project and the National Qualifications System in Turkey. The latter aims to develop occupational standards; support the vocational qualifications certification centres; and establish and operate an efficient and sustainable National Qualifications System based on an appropriate measurement assessment and certification system in line with the EQF and accepted occupational standards. At secondary school level, quality assurance is the responsibility of the Ministry.

School evaluations focus on compliance with central regulations and are a combination of external evaluation by ministerial school inspectors every 3 years and internal evaluation. Inspectors' reports are monitored and evaluated by the Directorate of Guidance and Inspection. VQA defines standards and appropriate procedures for quality assurance in CVET and authorises certification of organisations accredited in multilateral recognition with TURKAK (Turkish Accreditation Authority). CoHE is responsible for quality assurance in HE. Monitoring of HEIs is carried out by the Higher Education Supervision Board, which is part of the Higher Education Council and in charge of the external evaluation of universities, affiliated units, academic staff and their activities. In 2005, the Regulation for Academic Assessment and Quality Improvement in HEIs was adopted.

The TQM approach has been used for quality assurance QI in VET schools since 2009. Many schools carry out self-assessment following the Excellence Model developed by the European Foundation for Quality Management (EFQM) applied as the basis of the continuous improvement of areas of concern. Self-assessment is not mandatory but TQM Provincial Facilitators offer consultancy to schools / institutions planning a self-assessment process. To motivate schools to become involved in quality improvement (QI), MoNE introduced a range of awards for quality in education for formal and non-formal VET providers, according to a range of criteria focusing on management, performance and satisfaction ratings of stakeholders. MONE also promotes use of the ISO 9001 certificate.

Further investigation is required in relation to social partners' engagement in the governance arrangements for quality assurance related to VET provider institutions and VET provider self-evaluation standards, mechanisms, processes and procedures.

- Certification – assessment and validation of learning (system level)/monitoring, inspection and use of indicators

    MoNE runs a two-level quality assurance system where evaluation and supervision is conducted at the central level by the Directorate of Guidance and Inspection and at local level by Provincial Educational Supervisors (mandate includes: guidance, evaluation, supervision, investigation, analysis, training etc.).

1.2 Quality assurance arrangements at provider level in IVET

- Planning at VET provider level (including identification of training needs)
Education data is collected through various systems and means. For example, the Information System for Determining Educational Needs on Vocational and Technical Education (2005-13), e-school, a computerised web-based data management system, tracks students on an individual basis and the e-graduate project monitors the transition from VET to work. The 2010 e-graduate report presented data on: a. school types of graduates; b. year of graduation; c. ratio of graduates going on to HE; d. sectors in which graduates work; e. legal status of enterprises where graduates work; f. connection/relation between graduation and work field; g. social insurance status of graduates; h. rate of use of educational background in current job; i. graduate remuneration. MoNE Situation Assessment Studies, which track student achievement at / in various grades and subjects, are used to compare regions, schools and programmes, to inform policy development. International surveys, e.g., PISA and PIAAC, are carried out. Data on the ET2020 benchmarks are collected.

2. Continuous VET (CVET)

Introduction

Turkey has made considerable progress since 2014. One of the main highlights is the development and approval of TQF. The Regulations on the
Procedures and Principles for the Implementation of the Turkish Qualifications Framework (TQF) has been approved by the Cabinet Decision No. 2015/8213 and published in the Official Journal No. 29537 in 19 November 2015. Moreover, regulation on developing national occupational standards and qualifications has been amended as of 2015. Another legislative development is on the regulation of assessment and certification. There is also a new declaration dated 25/5/2015 stating that in 40 occupations workers must provide a VQA qualification certificate in order to be employed. Organisations need to make adjustments by 26/5/2016. VQA has signed 102 protocols with employer organisations, trade unions and nongovernmental organisations (NGOs) to develop occupational standards and 671were developed as of February 2016. Furthermore, 327 national qualifications have been put into effect. The vocational and technical education in the country needs to be revised and redesigned according to the national occupational standards. The system of assessment, evaluation and certification has been in progress in the country, leading to the establishment of ACBs, 41 in number, by February 2016. These centres conduct assessment, evaluation and certification in 159 national qualifications/occupations and VQA occupational qualification certificates are issued to those who succeed, the total number was 35971 as of February 2016

2.1 Quality assurance arrangements at system level in CVET

- National Framework for quality assurance in CVET – who is in charge of what?
Qualifications awarded in vocational, academic and general education and training programmes including primary, secondary and higher education, as well as those achieved in other learning contexts are described in the TQF which is designed to be in harmony with the European Qualifications Framework (EQF). The TQF is envisaged to cover all quality assured qualifications achieved in all learning contexts at all levels within Turkey's education and training system, as well as other learning environments (non-formal and informal).

The administrative structures for the implementation and governance of the TQF, the bodies which are responsible for awarding the qualifications and their responsibilities; the roles of bodies which have a responsibility in the implementation of TQF as well as awarding bodies, and their interaction; and the matters related to the management and monitoring mechanisms of the TQF are regulated in the TQF Regulation. As per the TQF Regulation, the TQF Council has been formed to conduct technical works related to the management and implementation of the TQF.